

Historic, archived document

Do not assume content reflects current scientific knowledge, policies, or practices.

**U.S. Department of Agriculture
Food and Nutrition Service**

MANAGEMENT BRIEFING

**Impact Evaluation of the
Farmers' Market Coupon Demonstration Project**

CONTRACT NO. 53-3198-0-017

April 24, 1991

Price Waterhouse



**IMPACT EVALUATION OF THE
FARMERS MARKET COUPON DEMONSTRATION PROJECT**

AGENDA

- **BACKGROUND**
- **IMPACT OF FMCDP ON WIC WOMEN**
- **IMPACT OF THE FMCDP ON FARMERS**
- **SUMMARY**

BACKGROUND

- **FMCDP OBJECTIVES AND OPERATIONS**
- **OBJECTIVES OF IMPACT EVALUATION STUDY**
- **STUDY METHODOLOGY**

FMCDP OBJECTIVES AND OPERATIONS

- **OBJECTIVES**

- **FRESH FRUITS AND VEGETABLES TO WIC PARTICIPANTS**
- **EXPAND AWARENESS, USE AND SALES OF FARMERS' MARKETS**

- **BENEFIT DISTRIBUTION**

- **WIC PARTICIPANTS RECEIVE COUPONS AT CLINIC**
- **PARTICIPANTS USE COUPON AT MARKET**
- **FARMERS REDEEM COUPONS FOR CASH**

- **PROGRAM SIZE AND FUNDING**

- **OPERATING IN TEN STATES**
- **\$2 M IN FEDERAL FUNDS**
- **STATES PROVIDE AT LEAST 30% OF COSTS**
- **\$2.5 M IN COUPONS REDEEMED**

IMPACT EVALUATION OBJECTIVES

- **DETERMINE THE IMPACT OF THE FMCDP ON WIC WOMEN:**
 - **FRUIT AND VEGETABLE CONSUMPTION**
 - **PATRONAGE OF FARMERS' MARKETS**

- **DETERMINE THE IMPACT OF THE FMCDP ON FARMERS**
 - **FARMERS' MARKET AND FARM INCOME**
 - **MARKET AND FARM OPERATIONS**
 - **FARMERS' MARKET SALES AND PRICES**

IMPACT EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

- **COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS BASED ON SURVEY**
 - **FMCDP RECIPIENTS COMPARED TO OTHER WIC WOMEN**
 - **FMCDP FARMERS COMPARED TO NON-FMCDP FARMERS**

- **WOMEN'S SURVEY METHODOLOGY**
 - **TELEPHONE SURVEY IN SIX STATES**

 - **RANDOM SAMPLES FROM 1990 WIC RECORDS**
 - **1,503 COUPON RECIPIENTS**
 - **1,126 NON-RECIPIENTS**
 - **96 PRIOR YEAR RECIPIENTS**

 - **SURVEY ASKED:**
 - **24 HOUR RECALL OF CONSUMPTION**
 - **USE OF COUPONS**
 - **PATRONAGE OF FARMERS' MARKETS**
 - **OPINIONS ABOUT FMCDP**

IMPACT EVALUATION METHODOLOGY (Continued)

- **FARMERS SURVEY METHODOLOGY**
 - **SURVEY CONDUCTED IN ALL TEN FMCDP STATES**
 - **24 RANDOMLY SELECTED FMCDP MARKETS,
24 MATCHED NON-PARTICIPATING MARKETS**
 - **FARMERS, MARKET MANAGERS INTERVIEWED AT
MARKET**
 - **265 PARTICIPATING FARMERS,
139 NON-PARTICIPATING FARMERS**
 - **ASKED ABOUT:**
 - **INCOME**
 - **FARM OPERATIONS**
 - **OPINIONS ABOUT FMCDP**
 - **VISITED NEARBY GROCERY STORES TO COMPARE
PRICES**

IMPACT OF FMCDP ON WIC WOMEN

- **RESPONDENT PROFILE**
- **FMCDP COUPON ISSUANCE AND USE**
- **EFFECT OF FMCDP ON CONSUMPTION**
- **EFFECT OF NUTRITIONAL INFORMATION ON CONSUMPTION**
- **EFFECT OF FMCDP ON MARKET PATRONAGE**
- **OPINIONS ABOUT FARMERS MARKETS**
- **OPINIONS ABOUT THE FMCDP**

PROFILE OF WIC SURVEY PARTICIPANTS

- **RECIPIENT AND NON-RECIPIENT GROUPS GENERALLY SIMILAR:**
 - **AVERAGE AGE OF 25**
 - **AVERAGE FAMILY SIZE OF 4.3**
 - **77 PERCENT NOT EMPLOYED**
 - **ONE-THIRD DID NOT GRADUATE HIGH SCHOOL**

- **RACIAL COMPOSITION OF GROUPS DIFFERED SLIGHTLY**
 - **61 PERCENT OF COUPON RECIPIENTS WHITE VERSUS 73 PERCENT OF NON-RECIPIENTS**
 - **NO KNOWN BIAS IN RESULTS**

- **COUPON RECIPIENTS MAY HAVE HAD EASIER ACCESS TO FARMERS' MARKETS THAN NON-RECIPIENTS**

ISSUANCE AND USE OF FARMERS' MARKET COUPONS

- **LAST DATE THAT COUPONS WERE RECEIVED:**

MAY	3%
JUNE	19%
JULY	40%
AUGUST	34%
SEPTEMBER	1%
DON'T KNOW	3%

- **APPROXIMATELY 60 PERCENT OF COUPONS SPENT**

- **DISTRIBUTION OF COUPON USE BY RECIPIENTS**

USED ALL COUPONS	35%
USED SOME COUPONS	34%
USED NO COUPONS	25%
DON'T KNOW	5%

- **THOSE WITH COUPONS PLAN TO SPEND MORE**

- **96 PERCENT WHO HAD ALREADY SPENT SOME**

- **87 PERCENT WHO HAD SPENT NONE**

EFFECT OF FMCDP ON CONSUMPTION

- RECIPIENTS REPORT GREATER CONSUMPTION:**

AVERAGE SERVINGS CONSUMED

	<u>RECIPIENTS</u>	<u>NON-RECIPIENTS</u>	<u>DIFFERENCE</u>
FRUIT	3.6	3.4	.2
VEGETABLES	4.1	3.9	.2

- RECIPIENTS MORE LIKELY TO REPORT INCREASE IN CONSUMPTION OVER LAST YEAR:**

PERCENT REPORTING INCREASED CONSUMPTION

	<u>RECIPIENTS</u>	<u>NON-RECIPIENTS</u>	<u>DIFFERENCE</u>
FRUIT	48%	43%	5%
VEGETABLES	43%	37%	6%

EFFECT OF FMCDP ON CONSUMPTION
(Continued)

- **PRIOR RECIPIENT DATA SUGGESTS LONG-TERM EFFECT**
(CAUTION: BASED ON SMALL SAMPLE)
 - **AVERAGE CONSUMPTION OF PRIOR COUPON RECIPIENTS SAME AS 1990 COUPON RECIPIENTS**
 - **PRIOR COUPON RECIPIENTS FREQUENTLY REPORTED MAINTAINING CONSUMPTION LEVEL OVER TIME**
 - **45% REPORTED FRUIT CONSUMPTION ABOUT THE SAME AS PRIOR YEAR**
 - **60% REPORTED VEGETABLE CONSUMPTION ABOUT THE SAME AS PRIOR YEAR**

EFFECT OF NUTRITIONAL INFORMATION ON CONSUMPTION

- **MOST WOMEN RECEIVE NUTRITION INFORMATION**
 - **70 PERCENT OF FMCDP RECIPIENTS**
 - **60 PERCENT OF NON-RECIPIENTS**
- **THOSE RECEIVING INFORMATION HAVE HIGHER CONSUMPTION OF FRESH FRUITS AND VEGETABLES:**

AVERAGE SERVINGS CONSUMED (TOTAL FRUITS AND VEGETABLES)

	<u>RECIPIENTS</u>	<u>NON-RECIPIENTS</u>	<u>DIFFERENCE</u>
INFORMATION	7.79	7.37	.42
<u>NO INFORMATION</u>	<u>7.35</u>	<u>7.01</u>	<u>.34</u>
DIFFERENCE	.44	.36	N/A

- **EFFECT OF RECEIVING NUTRITION INFORMATION IS SIMILAR TO EFFECT OF RECEIVING COUPONS**
- **EFFECT OF RECEIVING INFORMATION APPEARS TO BE ADDITIVE TO THAT OF RECEIVING COUPONS**

EFFECT OF FMCDP ON MARKET PATRONAGE

- **DO YOU SHOP AT FARMERS' MARKETS?**

COUPON RECIPIENTS 60%

PRIOR RECIPIENTS 40%

NON-RECIPIENTS 31%

- **WILL YOU CONTINUE TO SHOP AT FARMERS' MARKETS
EVEN IF YOU STOP RECEIVING COUPONS?**

DEFINITELY YES 50%

PROBABLY YES 30%

PROBABLY NO 11%

DEFINITELY NO 4%

DON'T KNOW 5%

OPINIONS ABOUT FARMERS' MARKETS

- **FARMERS' MARKETS: LESS CONVENIENT THAN GROCERY STORES, BUT HAVE BETTER PRICES AND SELECTION**

RECIP. NON-RECIP.

FARMERS' MARKET LOCATION

MORE CONVENIENT	18%	19%
EQUALLY CONVENIENT	31%	36%
LESS CONVENIENT	51%	43%

FARMERS' MARKET HOURS

MORE CONVENIENT	12%	11%
EQUALLY CONVENIENT	27%	34%
LESS CONVENIENT	59%	53%

FARMERS' MARKET PRICES

HIGHER	13%	9%
ABOUT THE SAME	23%	24%
LOWER	58%	63%

FARMERS' MARKET SELECTION

PREFER GROCERY SELECTION	18%	10%
NO PREFERENCE	10%	6%
PREFER MARKET SELECTION	69%	82%

OPINIONS ABOUT THE FMCDP

- **RECIPIENTS WHO SPENT COUPONS:**

PERCEIVE BENEFITS 80%

DON'T PERCEIVE BENEFITS 6%

DON'T KNOW 14%

- **COMMONLY MENTIONED BENEFITS:**

MORE FOOD 40%

BETTER NUTRITION 37%

FINANCIAL BENEFIT 8%

- **ONLY 17% PERCEIVED PROBLEMS WITH PROJECT**

MARKETS ARE NOT CONVENIENT 7%

COUPONS ARE DIFFICULT TO USE 3%

NOT ENOUGH COUPONS 2%

NOT ENOUGH FARMERS OR MARKETS 2%

POOR SELECTION/QUALITY AT MARKETS 2%

**OPINIONS ABOUT THE FMCDP
(Continued)**

- **MOST RECIPIENTS WHO SPENT COUPONS ARE
SATISFIED WITH PROJECT**

VERY SATISFIED	66%
SOMEWHAT SATISFIED	26%
SOMEWHAT DISSATISFIED	2%
VERY DISSATISFIED	1%
DON'T KNOW	5%

- **"WE ARE EATING MUCH BETTER SINCE WE GOT THE
COUPONS"**

IMPACT OF THE FMCDP ON FARMERS

- **PROFILE OF FARMER SURVEY PARTICIPANTS**
- **EFFECT OF FMCDP ON FARM INCOME**
- **EFFECT OF FMCDP ON PRICES AND OPERATIONS**
- **OPINIONS ABOUT THE PROJECT**

PROFILE OF FARMER SURVEY PARTICIPANTS

- PARTICIPATING FARMERS HAD LARGER FARMS
 - 15 ACRES FOR PARTICIPATING FARMERS
 - 3 ACRES FOR NON-PARTICIPATING FARMERS
- BOTH GROUPS OF FARMERS ARE ALSO INVOLVED IN OTHER TYPES OF FARMING

<u>TYPES OF FARMING</u>	<u>PARTICIPANTS</u>	<u>NON-PARTICIPANTS</u>
LIVESTOCK/POULTRY	26%	20%
GRAIN	20%	21%
HORTICULTURE	11%	13%
DAIRY	5%	4%

- INCOME ATTRIBUTABLE TO FARMERS' MARKETS VARIES BY SIZE OF FARM

<u>SIZE OF FARM</u>	<u>PARTICIPANTS</u>	<u>NON-PARTICIPANTS</u>
LESS THAN 5 ACRES	100%	100%
6 TO 40 ACRES	78%	75%
MORE THAN 40 ACRES	56%	43%

PROFILE OF FARMER SURVEY PARTICIPANTS
(Continued)

- **PARTICIPATING FARMERS HAVE BEEN SELLING AT FARMERS' MARKETS LONGER**

- **8 YEARS FOR PARTICIPATING FARMERS**

- **6 YEARS FOR NON-PARTICIPATING**

- **PARTICIPATING FARMERS SPEND MORE TIME SELLING AT FARMERS' MARKETS**

<u>TIME SELLING</u>	<u>PARTICIPANTS</u>	<u>NON-PARTICIPANTS</u>
MONTHS PER YEAR	4.7	4.0
DAYS PER WEEK	2.8	2.0
HOURS PER DAY	5.2	4.9

- **FARMERS GROW ABOUT 95% OF THE PRODUCE THEY SELL AT THE FARMERS' MARKETS**

EFFECT OF FMCDP ON FARM INCOME

- **AVERAGE COUPON REDEMPTIONS TO DATE WAS \$459**

SMALL FARMS (0 TO 5 ACRES) \$178

MEDIUM SIZE FARMS (6 TO 40 ACRES) \$527

LARGE FARMS (41 ACRES AND LARGER) \$722

- **INCOME FROM FARMERS' MARKET COUPONS VARIED SIGNIFICANTLY**

<u>AMOUNT RECEIVED</u>	<u>PERCENTAGE</u>
\$0 TO \$100	44%
\$101 TO \$500	37%
\$501 TO \$2,000	16%
\$2,001 OR MORE	3%

EFFECT OF FMCDP ON FARM INCOME
(Continued)

- **COUPON REDEMPTIONS LESS THAN 20% OF FARMERS' MARKET SALES**

- **18% OF AVERAGE WEEKDAY SALES (\$39 OF \$217)**

- **8% OF AVERAGE SATURDAY SALES (\$26 OF \$321)**

- **AVERAGE 12% INCREASE IN FARMERS' MARKET SALES SINCE JOINING FMCDP**

<u>SALES INCREASE</u>	<u>PERCENTAGE</u>
0 PERCENT	42%
1 TO 5 PERCENT	13%
6 TO 10 PERCENT	14%
11 TO 30 PERCENT	20%
31 PERCENT OR MORE	11%

EFFECT OF FMCDP ON PRICES AND OPERATIONS

- **FMCDP HAD LITTLE AFFECT ON PRICES**
 - **MINIMAL PRICE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN PARTICIPATING AND NON-PARTICIPATING MARKETS**
 - **80 PERCENT REPORTED NO PRICE CHANGE AFTER JOINING FMCDP**

- **FMCDP HAD MINIMAL EFFECT ON DECISION TO SELL AT FARMERS' MARKETS**
 - **73% SAID NO EFFECT**
 - **10% SAID LITTLE EFFECT**

- **FMCDP HAD LITTLE AFFECT ON OPERATIONS**
 - **10% PLAN TO CHANGE CROP PLAN**
 - **10% CHANGED TIME SPENT SELLING AT FARMERS' MARKETS**
 - **12% CHANGED THE DISPLAY OR PACKAGING OF PRODUCTS**

OPINIONS ABOUT THE PROJECT

- **MOST PARTICIPATING FARMERS PERCEIVED NO BENEFIT FOR THEMSELVES**
- **MOST FARMERS SUPPORT FMCDP BECAUSE OF THE BENEFIT TO WIC PARTICIPANTS**
 - **"[THE FMCDP] GETS FRESH FRUIT AND VEGETABLES TO PEOPLE WHO WOULD NOT BUY OTHERWISE"**
- **SHOULD THE FMCDP BE CONTINUED?**

CONTINUED AS IS	61%
CONTINUED W/ MINOR MODS	28%
CONTINUED W/ MAJOR MODS	5%
DISCONTINUED	<1%
DON'T KNOW	4%
- **ONLY 43% PERCEIVED PROBLEMS WITH PROJECT**

DENOMINATION OF COUPONS	20%
REIMBURSEMENT PROBLEMS	10%
UNINFORMED CONSUMERS	10%
NOT ENOUGH COUPONS	8%

SUMMARY

- **FMCDP ACHIEVED OBJECTIVES WITH REGARD TO WIC WOMEN**
 - **COUPON RECIPIENTS CONSUME MORE FRUITS AND VEGETABLES THAN NON-RECIPIENTS**
 - **COUPON RECIPIENTS MORE OFTEN SHOPPED AT FARMERS' MARKETS**
 - **SEEMS TO BE A LONG-TERM EFFECT**
- **FMCDP HAS HAD LITTLE EFFECT ON PARTICIPATING FARMERS**
 - **OVER 80% RECEIVED LESS THAN \$500**
 - **LESS THAN ONE-THIRD REPORTED ANY CHANGES IN:**
 - **PRICES**
 - **CROP PLAN**
 - **TIME SELLING AT MARKETS**
 - **DISPLAY OR PACKAGING OF PRODUCTS**
- **FARMERS STILL SUPPORTIVE OF FMCDP BECAUSE OF BENEFIT TO COUPON RECIPIENTS**